EXPERIMENTAL ARTICLES

Surviving Forms in Antibiotic-Treated *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*

A. L. Mulyukin^{a, 1}, A. N. Kozlova^a, V. V. Sorokin^a, N. E. Suzina^{*b*}, T. A. Cherdyntseva^{*c*}, **I. B. Kotova***^c* **, A. M. Gaponov***d, e***, A. V. Tutel'yan***d, e***, and G. I. El'-Registan***^a*

a Winogradsky Institute of Microbiology, Research Center of Biotechnology, Russian Academy of Sciences, Moscow, Russia b Skryabin Institute of Biochemistry and Physiology of Microorganisms, Russian Academy of Sciences, Pushchino, Russia

c Faculty of Biology, Lomonosov Moscow State University, Moscow, Russia

^d Central Research Institute of Epidemiology, Federal Service on Customers' Rights Protection

and Human Well-Being Surveillance, Moscow, Russia

e Rogachev Federal Scientific and Clinical Center for Pediatric Hematology, Oncology, and Immunology, Moscow, Russia Received February 11, 2015

Abstract—Survival of bacterial populations treated with lethal doses of antibiotics is ensured by very small numbers of persister cells. Unlike antibiotic-resistant cells, antibiotic tolerance of persisters is not inheritable and reversible. The present work provides evidence supporting the hypothesis on transformation (maturation) of persisters of an opportunistic pathogen *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*, revealed by ciprofloxacin (CF) treatment (25–100 μg/mL), into dormant cystlike cells (CLC) and nonculturable cells (NC), as was described previ ously for a number of non-spore-forming bacteria. Subpopulations of type 1 and type 2 persisters, which sur vived antibiotic treatment and developed into dormant forms, were heterogeneous in their capacity to form colonies or microcolonies upon germination as resistance to heating at 70°C and in cell morphology. Type 1 persisters, which were formed after 1-month incubation of the stationary-phase cultures grown in the medium with decreased C and N concentrations, developed in several types of surviving cells, including those similar to CLC in cell morphology. In the course of 1-month incubation of type 2 persisters, which were formed in exponentially growing cultures, other types of surviving cells developed: immature CLC and L-forms. Unlike *P. aeruginosa* CLC formed in the control post-stationary phase cultures without antibiotic treatment, most of 1-month persisters, especially type 2 ones, were characterized by the loss of colony-form ing capacity, probably due to transition into an nonculturable state with relatively high numbers of live intact cells (Live/Dead test). Another survival strategy of *P. aeruginosa* populations was ensured by a minor subpop ulation of CF-tolerant and CF-resistant cells able to grow in the form of microcolonies or regular colonies of decreased size in the presence of the antibiotic. The described *P. aeruginosa* dormant forms may be respon sible for persistent forms in bacteria carriers and latent infections and, together with antibiotic-resistant cells, are important as components of test systems to assay the efficiency of potential pharmaceuticals against resis tant infections.

Keywords: Pseudomonas aeruginosa, survival, antibiotic-tolerant persister cells, cystlike dormant cells, anti biotic-tolerant phenotypes

DOI: 10.1134/S0026261715060077

The tolerance of bacteria, especially obligate and opportunistic pathogens and clinical isolates, to anti microbial agents is currently receiving increasing attention in view of the decreasing efficiency of antibi otics (Lewis, et al., 2007; Millar et al., 2012; Grant and Hung, 2013). Research conducted in this field pro vides evidence that bacterial tolerance to antibiotics, i.e., their ability to survive (but not to proliferate) in their presence, may be associated with the following events. During the development of a bacterial culture, some cells within the population acquire the prolifer ative dormancy state and, therefore, become insensi tive to antibiotics. These cells include persisters whose cell cycle is disrupted (Bigger et al., 1944; Keren et al.,

2004a; Lewis et al., 2004; Kwan et al., 2013; Wood et al., 2013) due to a phenotypic transition (Balaban et al., 2004; Gefen and Balaban, 2009) and viable nonculturable cells (Roszak and Colwell, 1987; Li et al., 2014). Apart from persister cells, antibiotic tol erance is inherent to long-term surviving cystlike dor mant cells (CLC) (El'-Registan et al., 2006). Antibi otic-tolerant cells are revealed in biofilms that contain cells in various physiological states, including vegeta tive, metabolically quiescent, and persister cells (Cos terton et al., 1999; Shah et al., 2006; Lewis et al., 2007). Importantly, the state of metabolic dormancy (anabiosis) that is typical of CLC implicates an increased phenotypic variability during their germina tion (El'-Registan et al., 2006). It manifests itself in colony morphology variability, including the develop-

¹ Corresponding author; e-mail: andlm@mail.ru

ment of stress-resistant variants that were detected in *Mycobacterium smegmatis, Staphylococcus aureus*, and *Corynebacterium pseudodiphtheriticum* (Mulyukin et al., 2010, 2014).

Of paramount importance for general and clinical microbiology is antibiotic tolerance/resistance of the gram-negative nonnon-spore-forming bacterium *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*, a pathogen that causes a number of infectious diseases and is named as "the microbial hyena" (Fick, 1993). It was established that, during the life-cycle of submerged cultures of this bac terium, an extremely small subpopulation of persisters emerged that were tolerant to antibiotics including flu oroquinolones. The persister number increased during development of the culture from the exponential to the stationary growth phase (Keren et al., 2004b). The important role of the state of proliferative dormancy in terms of survival of *P. aeruginosa* is emphasized by the data on the nondividing persister cells isolated by flow cytometry of disintegrated biofilms being tolerant to an antibiotic (tobramycin) and other antimicrobial agents (silver ions) (Kim et al., 2009). Another *P. aeruginosa* survival strategy is based upon a revers ible transition of its cells into a metabolically inactive nonculturable state under the influence of bactericidal agents (copper or chlorine ions) (Dwidjosiswojo et al., 2011; Bédard et al., 2014) or other stressors (freezing and thawing) (Leung et al., 1995). Inactive *P. aerugi nosa* cells that lacked enzyme activities and did not express the green fluorescent protein accounted for a significant part of the biofilm population (Xu et al., 1998; Kim et al., 2009). Variants that were insensitive to specific antibiotics were also isolated from biofilms (Drenkard and Ausubel, 2002; Kirisits et al., 2005).

In terms of the general issue of *P. aeruginosa* persis tence, the question to be raised concerns the subse quent fate of persister cells, their possible transition to dormant forms including CLC or other types that may enable population survival in the presence of antibiot ics, and the relation between the dormant state of per sisters and the appearance of antibiotic-tolerant phe notypes. Even though cystlike type dormant forms have not been documented in *P. aeruginosa*, their for mation has been revealed in other representatives of the genus *Pseudomonas* (Mulyukin et al., 2008). The main approach that was earlier applied to stimulate CLC formation in pseudomonads involved the use of nutrient-imbalanced or nutrient-limited media that enhance lipid formation (El'-Registan et al., 2006). These studies can be expanded on by elucidating the relationship between two different events in *P. aerugi nosa* populations, i.e., survival of persister cells in the presence of an antibiotic and formation of CLC.

The goal of the present work was to investigate the surviving forms of *P. aeruginosa* in the presence of ciprofloxacin and the relationship between their sur vival and phenotypic intrapopulation variation, including the emergence of antibiotic-tolerant vari ants.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

The subjects of this work were two strains of the gram-negative bacterium *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*: PAO1 (from the collection of the Institute of Molecu lar Genetics, Russian Academy of Sciences) and 393 (from the collection of the Microbiology Department of the Biology Faculty of Lomonosov Moscow State University). The *Pseudomonas* cultures were grown in Luria–Bertani (LB) broth or in a semisynthetic medium containing the following (g/L): glucose, 30; NaNO₃, 10; NaH₂PO₄ · 2H₂O, 1.1; KCl, 1; MgSO₄ · 7H₂O, 0.2; yeast extract (Difco), 5; and distilled water (pH 7.2). The inoculum that was grown overnight (for 18 h) in LB broth was added at a concentration yielding the culture optical density of 0.2 measured using a Jenway 7315 spectrophotometer (Germany) λ = 450 nm, *l* = 1 cm. The bacteria were cultivated in 250 mL flasks with 50 mL of the medium at 28°C on an orbital shaker (140–160 rpm). The semisynthetic medium was modified by decreasing the content of the inorganic nitrogen and carbon sources twofold and that of yeast extract tenfold.

Type 1 persisters (P1) of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* that formed at the stationary phase and type 2 persis ters (P2) in exponentially growing populations (according to the classification suggested by Balaban et al., 2004) were detected by challenging the cultures of the respective age to ciprofloxacin (CF) at concen trations of 5–100 μg/mL. The experimental and con trol cultures (with and without CF) were stored for 24 h to 1 month under static conditions at room tem perature with periodic shaking. In order to determine the viability of bacterial cells, they were washed three times to remove the antibiotic (centrifugation at 7000 *g* followed by discarding the supernatant), resus pended in physiological saline (pH 7.2) according to Möker et al. (2010), and plated onto the relevant media.

The colony-forming capacity (CFU/mL) was deter mined by plating 10^N times-diluted cultures on agar media (1.8% agar, wt/vol) that were incubated at 28°C for 3–5 days. The number of cells that formed micro colonies (mCFU/mL) was determined by scanning the agar surface with a binocular microscope at a mag nification of 2.5–5. Capacity of microcolonies to revert to the original phenotype was assessed by plating them on solid media. The most probable number of cells (MPN/mL) capable of growing in liquid media was estimated from the growth of serially diluted cul tures in wells of Corning plates (50 μL of cell suspen sion plus $450 \mu L$ of the medium). The number of viable cells was determined using LB broth-based liquid and solid media as well as semisolid (0.3%) agar.

Heat resistance was determined from the number of cells that remained viable (based on CFU and mCFU counts) upon heating the cell suspensions at 70°C for 5 min.

The phenotypic variability of bacteria was deter mined based on emergence of variants that differed from the dominant type in colony size, shape, consis tency, and color.

Antibiotic-resistant variants were detected on solid media with CF at concentrations of 1, 5, and 10 μg/mL, and their frequency was estimated as a per centage of the total number of colonies on the antibiotic-free medium. The isolated CF-resistant variants were consecutively plated at least three times on selec tive media with the same and higher CF concentra tions (1–2.5 μg/mL; 2.5–5 μg/mL; 5–10 μg/mL; 10– $20 \mu g/mL$; $20-50 \mu g/mL$; and $50-100 \mu g/mL$).

Microscopic studies were conducted using a Zeto pan (Reichert, Austria) or an Axioplan (Carl Zeiss, Germany) microscope. Bacterial cells were stained with Live/Dead Baclight kit® L-13152 (Molecular Probes) to distinguish between the live and dead cells; at least 20 fields were scanned and at least 1000 cells were monitored. Suspensions with a low cell density were concentrated 100-fold.

Electron microscopy studies. Precipitated cells were fixed in 1.5% glutaraldehyde in 0.05 M cacody late buffer (pH 7.2) at 4° C for 1 h, washed three times in the same buffer, and additionally fixed with 1% $OsO₄$ in 0.05 M cacodylate buffer (pH 7.2) at 20 $^{\circ}$ C for 3 h. After dehydration, the samples were embedded in Epon 812 epoxy resin. Ultrathin sections were con trasted for 30 min with 3% uranyl acetate solution in 70% ethanol and thereupon stained with lead citrate according to Reinolds at 20°C for 5 min. The sections were examined in a JEM-1400 electron microscope (JEOL, Japan) at an accelerating voltage of 80 kV.

Statistical analysis was performed using the stan dard tools such as calculating the mean square devia tion within a data array, applying the Student *t*-test, and establishing the correlations between two data sets. The probability criterion of $P < 0.05$ was considered sufficient for regarding the difference between data sets as significant.

RESULTS

The survivability of type 2 and 1 (P2 and P1) *P. aeruginosa* persisters was monitored under nutri tional conditions of culture development, which dif fered from those (C/N-imbalance and N limitation) used to stimulate the formation of cystlike dormant cells (Mulyukin et al., 2010, 2014). This work mainly focuses on the long-term survival of antibiotic-treated persister subpopulations, bearing in mind that their number in *P. aeruginosa* cultures is expected to be very low (Keren et al., 2004b; Möker et al., 2010). We empirically selected the medium variants (a rich medium and a modified synthetic medium with decreased C and N content) on which the cultures developed at an identical rate (growth curves not shown) with a high biomass yield (Tables 1 and 2). The differences in nutrient concentrations could influence

MICROBIOLOGY Vol. 84 No. 6 2015

the persisters' survival during their long-term incuba tion (for 1 month and still longer periods). Under the given conditions, the number of cells in exponentially growing and stationary cultures $(10^8 - 10^9 \text{ CFU/mL}$, respectively) and that of antibiotic-tolerant persisters $(10⁴-10⁷ CFU/mL)$ was sufficient for microbiological research.

Formation and Survival of Type 2 Persisters

Persister formation. In exponential-phase $(6-7 h)$ *P. aeruginosa* PAO1 cultures, the P2 number was determined by adding bactericidal doses of ciproflox acin (CF) that killed the overwhelming majority of antibiotic-sensitive cells. On Fig. 1, typical bacterial death curves are presented. After 3 h of CF treatment $(5-100 \mu g/mL)$, the P2 number varied within the $(1 2) \times 10^4$ CFU/mL range, which accounted for 0.002– 0.006% of the cell number in the culture prior to CF addition (Fig. 1a). The same P2 percentage was revealed in the exponentially growing culture of strain 393 (Fig. 1b). The P2 number and percentage of both strains were independent on the composition of either rich (Fig. 1, curves *1*) or modified (Fig. 1, curves *2*) medium. Interestingly, the P2 cells of strain 393 developing in the modified medium were less sen sitive to the CF effect. The threshold concentration, above which the degree of the cell-killing effect did not depend on the antibiotic dose, was 25 μg/mL (Fig. 1b). This is in contrast to the CF effect on the persisters of strain PAO1 whose threshold concentra tion was $5 \mu g/mL$ (Fig. 1a).

Surviving minor P2 fractions of the strains *P. aeruginosa* PAO1 and 393 were heterogeneous in terms of tolerance/resistance to CF. The bulk fraction represented antibiotic-tolerant persisters that form colonies of the dominant S type $(d = 5-10$ mm) (Tables 1 and 2) after plating of washed cell suspen sions on LB agar. The colonies produced by P2 persis ters appeared on days 3–5, which indicated a slow down in the division of persister cells, in contrast to the control cultures in which colony growth occurred after 24–36 h. Apart from S type colonies whose cell numbers did not exceed $10^4 - 10^5$ CFU/mL, the LB agar-cultivated populations produced point microcol onies (mCFU) with $d \le 0.5$ mm that were difficult to detect; they were revealed during prolonged incuba tion (for 7–14 days or, in some cases, for up to 1 month). When the numbers of S colony-forming cells in the platings of the experimental and control cultures was above 10^5 CFU/mL, no microcolonies were revealed on LB agar. A prerequisite for their pref erential development was creating selective condi tions, i.e., adding $CF(1 \mu g/mL)$ to the solid medium on which the dominant antibiotic-sensitive S type was eliminated. As was demonstrated on randomly chosen samples (40 mCFUs), efficiency of the reversion of microcolonies to the S type in LB agar subcultures did

MULYUKIN et al.

ulation

* The fraction of persisters and the AR and AT variants (% of the total number of viable cells before adding CF) is given in parentheses.

** In determining microcolony numbers, account was taken of the revealed 20% reversion to active growth.

*** If the macrocolony number was large, microcolonies were not detected.

not exceed 20%, and this was taken into account while estimating their numbers (Tables 1 and 2). The cells of the CF treatment-surviving fraction that were respon sible for microcolony development could grow in the presence of elevated CF concentrations (5 and $10 \mu g/mL$, and their numbers $(10^2 - 10^3 \text{ mCFU/mL})$ were virtually independent on the antibiotic dose in the solid medium (Table 3). Taking account of their antibiotic tolerance, slow growth, and the ~10-fold reduced size of the colonies they formed, these cells apparently belong to the SCV (small colony variant) phenotype that was revealed in *P. aeruginosa* (Dren kard and Ausubel, 2002; review by Grant and Hung, 2013 and references therein). The fractions that remained viable 3 h after response to the antibiotic addition lacked antibiotic-resistant variants (Tables 1 and 2) that developed on LB agar with $CF(1 \mu g/mL)$

in the form of colonies belonging to the S type or to the closely related Sm type with a somewhat smaller col ony diameter $(d = 2-5$ mm).

Survival 1 month after CF treatment. Type 2 persis ters that formed in exponentially growing cultures of *P. aeruginosa* PAO1 in the rich medium were charac terized by a low survival rate. The numbers of the cells forming characteristic S type colonies was 4 orders of magnitude lower in survivor fractions (1 month of incubation; plots not shown). The cells of strain PAO1 that developed in the modified medium and were incubated for the same time retained the capacity for forming microcolonies but not macrocolonies whose titer decreased to zero (Fig. 2a). The numbers of cul turable cells that could grow on solid or liquid media were 2–3 orders of magnitude below the total number of "live" cells (based on the Live/Dead test) (Table 4).

Table 2. The numbers of viable cells: type 2 persisters and antibiotic-resistant (AR) (CFU/mL) and antibiotic-tolerant (AT) (mCFU/mL) variants in the control and experimental cultures of *P. aeruginosa* 393 that developed in the rich and modified media 3 hrs and 1 month after adding ciprofloxacin (CF , 25 μ g/mL)

Culture	Cell number (CFU/mL) on the agar without $CF($ % of the cell number before adding CF [*]	Cell number (CFU/mL) of the AR variants on the agar with CF $(1 \mu g/mL)$	Microcolony number** $(mCFU/mL)$ on the agar without CF	Microcolony number (mCFU/mL), AT vari- ants, on the agar with CF $(1 \mu g/mL)**$	
Growth in the rich medium (LB broth), 3 h after adding CF					
Control culture, exponen- tial phase (7 h after inocula- tion) before adding CF	$(1.0 \pm 0.2) \times 10^{10}$ (100%)	θ	$0***$	$(8.0 \pm 1.2) \times 10^{2}$ $(8 \times 10^{-6}\%)$	
Control culture, 3 h after adding CF, the P2 subpopu- lation	$(6.0 \pm 0.7) \times 10^5$ $(6 \times 10^{-3}\%)$	θ	$0***$	$(1.6 \pm 0.3) \times 10^3$ $(1.6 \times 10^{-5}\%)$	
Growth in modified medium (with decreased C and N contents), 3 h after adding CF					
Control culture, exponen- tial phase (7 h after inocula- tion) before adding CF	$(4.8 \pm 0.7) \times 10^9$ (100%)	θ	$0***$	$(8.0 \pm 1.2) \times 10^{2}$ $(1.6 \times 10^{-5}\%)$	
Control culture, 3 h after adding CF, the P2 subpopu- lation	$(1.1 \pm 0.1) \times 10^5$ $(2 \times 10^{-3}\%)$	θ	$0***$	$(5.0 \pm 0.8) \times 10^3$ $(10^{-4}\%)$	
Growth in modified medium, 1 month after adding CF					
Control culture, exponen- tial phase (7 h after inocula- tion) before adding CF	$(1.7 \pm 0.3) \times 10^9$ (100%)	Ω	$0***$	$(6.0 \pm 1.0) \times 10^{1}$ $(10^{-6}\%)$	
Culture with CF, surviving P ₂ fraction	$(6.8 \pm 0.9) \times 10^6$ (0.14%)	$(1.3 \pm 0.1) \times 10^6$ $(2 \times 10^{-2} \%)$	$0***$	$(2.4 \pm 0.4) \times 10^3$ $(5 \times 10^{-5}\%)$	

* The fraction of persisters and the AR and AT variants (% of the total number of viable cells before adding CF) is given in parentheses.

** In determining microcolony numbers, account was taken of the revealed 20% reversion to active growth.

*** If the macrocolony number was large, microcolonies were not detected.

Dynamics of the numbers of culturable cells was inde pendent of the CF concentration added (25 and 100 μg/mL). The P2 subpopulations that survived for 1 month contained, apart from antibiotic-tolerant cells that formed microcolonies on LB agar with or without CF, antibiotic-resistant cells $(-6 \times$ 102 cells/mL, i.e., 20% of the number of surviving cul turable cells) that were not detectable 3 h after CF treatment. The presence of antibiotic-resistant vari ants in P2 fractions that were stored for a long time could be due to the increased number of their cells that could proliferate in the medium with the antibiotic. Enhanced survival potential was characteristic of the cells of the strain 393 subpopulation in the CF-con taining medium (after 1 month of incubation). It man ifested itself in retention of the capacity to form con ventional S type colonies and the presence of an enlarged pool of antibiotic-resistant variants $(10⁶$ cells/mL) (Table 2).

Formation and Survival of Type 1 Persisters

In all likelihood, the subpopulation of type 1 per sisters in stationary-phase cultures is mixed (Balaban et al., 2004) and contributed by type 2 persisters.

Persister formation. In the stationary-phase (20 h) PAO1 cultures developing in the modified medium, the P1 number was 10^7 CFU/mL $(0.2\%$ of the cell number in the cultures prior to adding CF); it was 3 orders of magnitude above the P2 number in expo nentially growing cultures in the same medium (Table 1). The similar dependence of the P1 number and percentage on the physiological age of the culture was revealed for strain 393 (data not shown).

The P1 numbers in stationary-phase cultures of strain PAO1 formed in the rich medium (LB broth) were lower than in the modified medium. It was $3 \times$ 10^5 CFU/mL (3×10^{-3} % of the CFU titer in the cultures without CF) (Table 1). As far as strain 393 was concerned, no significant differences were revealed

Fig. 1. Type 2 persister numbers in *P. aeruginosa* PAO1 (a) and 393 (b) cultures 3 h after adding ciprofloxacin (5– 100 µg/mL). The cultures develop in the rich medium (*1*) and the modified medium with decreased C and N content (*2*). Persister fraction is shown as percent of the CFU number in the control cultures. Deviation values (5–10%) are not given.

between the P1 numbers in the rich and the modified medium (0.5 and 0.25%).

The survival of *P. aeruginosa* PAO1 cultures was secured by the presence of P1 subpopulations, along with the P2 subpopulations that formed earlier. The fraction of the cells that was viable 3 h after the CF treatment was heterogeneous. In addition to charac teristic S type colonies, microcolonies of antibiotic tolerant variants and of antibiotic-resistant Sm types developed on solid medium (LB agar with CF, 1 μg/mL). The latter variants were not detected on the media without the antibiotic, and they accounted for a minor $(10^{-7}-10^{-8}\%)$ fraction of the total cell population (Table 1). A peculiar feature of strain 393 was that

Fig. 2. Viable cell numbers in the P2 (a) and P1 (b) frac tions of *P. aeruginosa* PAO1 (grown in the modified medium and stored for 1 month). Designations: control cultures (without CF), line (*1*): experimental cultures with 25 µg/mL CF, lines (*2*) and (*4*); experimental cultures with 100 µg/mL CF, lines (*3*) and (*5*). CFU numbers, full lines (*1, 2*, and *3*); mCFU numbers, dashed lines (*4* and *5*). Deviation values (5–10%) are not given.

the number and percentage of the slowly growing CF resistant Sm variants revealed 15–22 days after inocu lation $({\sim}10^3 \text{ CFU/mL}$; 10⁻⁶% of the CFU number in the culture before CF addition) (Table 2) were higher than those of strain PAO1.

Survival 1 month after the CF treatment. In both strains, the P1 cells that formed in the stationary phase cultures developing in the rich medium exhib ited a low survival rate during 1 month. The CFU numbers decreased by 5–6 orders of magnitude (plots not shown). A prerequisite for long-term survival of P1 cells (as well as of P2 cells) was growing the cultures in the modified medium with decreased C and N con-

Culture	Microcolony number (mCFU/mL) on LB agar with CF					
	$1 \mu g/mL$	$5 \mu g/mL$	$10 \mu g/mL$			
P. aeruginosa PAO1						
Control culture, exponential phase without CF, 7 h before adding CF	$(2.0 \pm 0.5) \times 10^3$	$(6.0 \pm 0.8) \times 10^2$	$(1.0 \pm 0.3) \times 10^3$			
Experimental culture, exponential phase, 3 h after adding CF $(25 \mu g/mL)$, the P2 subpopulation	$(5.0 \pm 0.3) \times 10^{2}$	$(1.4 \pm 0.3) \times 10^{2}$	$(1.6 \pm 0.4) \times 10^{2}$			
Experimental culture, stationary phase, 3 h after adding CF $(25 \mu g/mL)$, the P1 subpopulation	$(2.0 \pm 0.5) \times 10^3$	$(9.2 \pm 0.9) \times 10^{2}$	$(4.8 \pm 0.5) \times 10^{2}$			
P. aeruginosa 393						
Control culture, exponential phase without CF, 7 h before adding CF	$(8.0 \pm 1.2) \times 10^{2}$	$(1.0 \pm 0.2) \times 10^3$	$(5.0 \pm 0.7) \times 10^{2}$			
Experimental culture, exponential phase, 3 h after adding $CF(25 \mu g/mL)$, the P2 subpopulation	$(5.0 \pm 0.8) \times 10^3$	$(2.0 \pm 0.2) \times 10^3$	$(2.4 \pm 0.5) \times 10^3$			
Experimental culture, exponential phase, 1 month after adding CF, the P2 subpopulation	$(2.4 \pm 0.4) \times 10^3$	$(2.4 \pm 0.4) \times 10^3$	$(1.8 \pm 0.1) \times 10^3$			

Table 3. Numbers of cells that grow in the form of microcolonies in the presence of various CF concentratioms in the con trol and experimental cultures of *P. aeruginosa* PAO1 and 393

tent. In this system, the titer of the cells forming con ventional colonies on LB agar without the antibiotic decreased by 2–3 orders of magnitude in both strain PAO1 (Fig. 2b) and 393. Long-term (1-month) storage of the P1 fraction of strain 393 resulted in an increase in the numbers of rapidly growing CF-resis tant variants of the S type, which was apparently due to cell proliferation. The antibiotic-tolerant phenotype forming microcolonies (mCFUs) on agar media with CF was also retained. Consecutive subculturing of the antibiotic-resistant variants of both strains revealed their capacity for growth on solid media in the pres ence of increasing CF concentrations (within the 5– 20 μg/mL range). As the number of transfers increased, the Sm type colonies that dominated on LB agar with 5 and 10 μ g/mL CF in the first transfer were replaced by conventional S type colonies. Only the microcolony-forming variant developed in LB agar subcultures in the presence of high CF doses $(20 \mu g/mL)$.

Hence, modifying the medium composition was essential for long-term (1-month) survival of type 2 and 1 persisters.

Survival of the Control Cultures

The post-stationary control cultures (without CF) of both strains in the modified medium retained a high CFU titer for 1 month. The survival rate was particu larly high in the populations of *P. aeruginosa* PAO1 whose CFU titer for a long time remained at the same level (35–45%) as that of stationary-phase cultures

MICROBIOLOGY Vol. 84 No. 6 2015

(Fig. 2, b). The ratio between the number of culturable cells (determined from the CFU titer) and the total number of living cells (based on the Live/Dead test) was 63% (Table 4) in 1-month control cultures. The number of antibiotic-tolerant cells that could grow in the form of microcolonies on the selective medium with CF (1 μ g/mL and above) varied from 10² to 103 mCFU in the control cultures during the expo nential and stationary growth phases; it did not depend on the culture's physiological age or the medium (Tables 1–3). The antibiotic-resistant Sm type was lacking, or its frequency was extremely low.

The Hypothesis on Conversion of Persisters into Metabolically Dormant Forms

In contrast to 1-month control cultures, the loss of colony-forming capacity in the overwhelming major ity in P1 and P2 fractions stored for a long time (at least for 1 month), while the number of live cells remained high (Table 4) could be associated with their transition to the nonculturable state (profound dor mancy), so that their resuscitation should require spe cial reactivating techniques.

Populations of the P1 and P2 survivors were heter ogeneous in their capacity for germination in the form of micro- or conventional colonies (Fig. 2, Tables 1, 2, and 4). Therefore, analysis of the relationship between their numbers and those of the dormant forms in the control cultures presents serious difficulties. Develop ment of resistance to damaging factors such as heating at 70°C for 5 min, i.e., to conditions that produce a

Type 1 persisters

Control cultures (without CF)

 $(4-6) \times 10^{4}$ cells/mL–MPN 0.22–0.27%

 $(5.0 \pm 0.2) \times 10^9$ CFU/mL 63%

 $(4.9 \pm 0.2) \times 10^4$ CFU/mL

Table 4. Total number of "live" cells (according to the Live/Dead test) that can grow on solid and liquid media in the per sister subpopulations of *P. aeruginosa* PAO1 grown on the modified medium with 25 µg/mL CF added and stored for 1 month

lethal effect on vegetative cells of exponentially grow ing and stationary cultures (Figs. 3a, 3b) can be regarded as evidence that persisters acquire the state of metabolic (not only proliferative) dormancy.

For instance, after 1 month of incubation, the numbers of heat-resistant P1 and P2 cells of strain PAO1 (developing in the modified medium) increased from zero to $10^3 - 10^4$ CFU/mL (Figs. 3a, 3b). This indicates transition to the ametabolic state that is characterized by resistance to detrimental factors. The increased number of heat-resistant dormant forms was revealed in the control cultures (Fig. 3c). The presence of the microcolony-forming cell fraction in suspen sions with CF (Figs. 3a, 3b) apparently suggests that the antibiotic promotes the enhancement of the dormant state and population-level phase variation activ ity. The number of P1 forms after 1 month and their heat resistance (Fig. 3b) were comparable to those of the dormant forms that produce conventional colonies (CFUs) after heating (Fig. 3a). Similar data were also obtained for strain 393; the total share of heat-resis tant cells (heated at 70°C for 5 min) in 1-month P1 and P2 fractions, based on the CFU and mCFU titers, varied from 4 to 36% of the number of unheated cells.

Hence, the fractions of surviving type 1 and 2 per sisters in 1-month *P. aeruginosa* cultures included a subpopulation of highly resistant cells that apparently acquired the ametabolic dormant state.

The hypothesis that persisters are transformed into dormant forms was additionally supported by compar ative studies on the ultrastructural organization of the cells (exemplified by strain PAO1) that survived for 1 month in the control and the experimental cultures.

Fine Structure of Dormant Forms and Surviving Persisters in 1-Month Cultures of P. aeruginosa PAO1

In control *P. aeruginosa* PAO1 cultures (incubated for 1 month in the modified medium without CF), intact cells were dominant and possessed the ultra structure (Figs. 4c, 4d) identical to CLC of other *Pseudomonas* species (Mulyukin et al., 2008) and dif ferent from preceding vegetative cells (Figs. 4a, 4b). The cells with pronounced signs of destruction and lysis accounted for only several percent of cells in 1-month cultures. The CLC of the control variants of strain PAO1 were characterized by absent cell division signs, a thickened cell wall with a laminar structure, a clumpy texture of the cytoplasm that contained elec tron-transparent inclusions, and the presence of elec tron-dense compaction areas in the nucleoid.

The P1 fractions in the modified medium (14 days and 1 month after adding 25 μg/mL CF) were mor phologically heterogeneous (Figs. 5a–5d). Cells of the first morphological type displayed the same features as CLC in the control cultures (Figs. 4c, 4d). Cells of the second type that were also regarded as cystlike cells were characterized by loop-shaped protrusions on the outer membrane and by an enlarged periplasmic space at the cell poles containing an electron-dense sub stance (Figs. 5a, 5d). Cells of the third type contain a fine-grained electron-dense cytoplasm in which inter cellular structures were difficult to discern (Figs. 5a, 5c). Along with intact cells, we observed lysing cells that retained cell envelopes and contained a clear cytoplasm; the nucleoids showed signs of disintegra tion.

Most cells in P2 subpopulations in the modified medium (22 h after adding CF) were subject to
destruction (Fig. 6a). The cells that remained intact
(Figs. 6a–6c) and plausibly belonged to P2 were simidestruction (Fig. 6a). The cells that remained intact (Figs. 6a–6c) and plausibly belonged to P2 were simi-

 $(2.2 \pm 0.6) \times 10^7$ cells/mL

 $(8.0 \pm 0.6) \times 10^9$ cells/mL

lar to the CLC of the second and third type in the P1 fraction (Fig. 5). In the P2 fractions incubated for 1 month, the very few cells that were detected among the debris were characterized by (Figs. 6d–6f) an enlarged periplasmic space filled with a low electron density substance (Fig. 6f), a wave-like profile of the outer membrane (Fig. 6d), and an electron-dense cytoplasm with a homogenous or heterogeneous tex ture (Figs. 6b–6f). Another type of cell lacked the cell wall and was similar to L forms (Fig. 6e). The first CLC type was not characteristic of the P2 fractions.

The data obtained provide evidence for existence of several survival strategies of antibiotic-treated *P. aeruginosa* populations. These strategies involve (i) a pool of antibiotic-tolerant persister cells, (ii) anti biotic-tolerant variants that grow slowly forming microcolonies on the media with and without the anti biotic, and (iii) antibiotic-resistant variants that can form colonies of the conventional types or Sm colo nies. According to the hypothesis put forward by us, long-term survival of populations (for 1 month and still longer periods) is ensured by conversion of persis ters into the dormant cells including nonculturable cells that lose their colony-forming capacity under the standard growth conditions.

DISCUSSION

The existence of persisters in *P. aeruginosa* and other bacteria is a well-known fact. The reported dynamics of persister cell numbers and the pattern of their increase in the aging cultures of the tested *P. aeruginosa* strains are consistent with the previously obtained data concerning *P. aeruginosa* (Keren et al., 2004b; Möker et al., 2010). Decreased nutrient con tent in the medium provided for an increase in persis ter frequency in the stationary-phase culture of strain PAO1 (the data were obtained 3 h after adding CF), compared to the pattern of development in the rich medium (Table 1). This is in line with the data on the role of nitrogen limitation in promoting persister for mation in *P. aeruginosa* (Nguen et al., 2011).

In this work, new data were obtained on the role of trophic conditions under which a *Pseudomonas* cul ture develops for the relatively long-term (1 month long) survival of persisters. A relatively good survival rate was attained by the P1 cells (a mixed subpopula tion) that was formed during the growth of *P. aerugi nosa* in the modified medium with decreased C and N content (Fig. 2). Interestingly, the number of CLC forming during the one-month incubation period which were capable of reverting to active growth (in terms of CFU/mL numbers) was higher in the control (CF-free) cultures than in the variants growing in the rich medium. This lends support to the hypothesis that persisters convert ("maturate") into CLC-type dor mant forms. This is also in line with the fact that the ultrastructural organization of 1-month P1 cells and of the CLC from the control cultures was identical

MICROBIOLOGY Vol. 84 No. 6 2015

Fig. 3. Heat-resistant cell number in *P. aeruginosa* PAO1 in the P2 (a) and P2 (b) subpopulations and in cultures grown without adding CF (c) at the initial moment and after 1 month. Designations: C, unheated cultures; T, heated cultures (70 \degree C, 5 min). Deviation values (5–10%) are not given.

(Figs. 4 and 5). It was also revealed that type 2 persis ters could convert into dormant forms either belong ing to the CLC type or differing from it in morpholog ical terms (Fig. 6). Most of the P2 and P1 cells that survived for 1 month and remained intact (according to the data of the Live/Dead test) lost the ability to form microcolonies. Apparently, this was due to their transition to an nonculturable state, which was caused by the toxic effect of CF (but not by the trophic condi tions), similar to the effects of other antimicrobial

Fig. 4. Electron micrographs of the sections of *P. aeruginosa* PAO1 cells during the exponential (a) and the stationary (b) growth phase and of 1-month CLC (c, d). The culture grew in the modified medium with reduced C and N content. Designations: CW, cell wall; OM, outer membrane; IL CW, individual layers of the cell wall; CM, cytoplasmic membrane; I, inclusions; N, nucleoid; cN, compaction areas of the nucleoid. Bar, $0.5 \mu m$.

agents such as copper or chlorine ions (Dwidjosiswojo et al., 2011; Bédard et al., 2014).

The subpopulations of cells that were generated by the "maturation" of the P2 and P1 cells of *P. aerugi nosa* PAO1 1 month after the addition of the antibiotic were characterized by a larger morphological diversity (Figs. 5, 6; note the existence of several structural types, including CLC analogs and other kinds of cells, e.g., L forms) than the subpopulations of dormant cells forming in aging (1 month) cultures without CF (Fig. 4). The P2 cells of *P. aeruginosa* that survived the CF treatment in exponentially growing cultures failed to form mature type 1 CLC, in contrast to the P1 cells that survive in experimental cultures for 1 month. Therefore, it is essential that the persister subpopula tions formed at various stages of the development of bacterial cultures should be pre-adapted for the subsequent transition to the dormant state; an important role should also be assigned to quorum-dependent (i.e., culture density-dependent) and other autoregu latory mechanisms. In the context of the hypothesis concerning conversion of persisters into the dormant forms, it is of relevance that the P2 numbers in loga rithmic-phase *P. aeruginosa* cultures increased upon addition of *N*-(3-oxododecanoyl)-L-homoserine lac tone and phenazinpyocyanine (Möker et al., 2010), the signal molecules of the quorum-sensing systems of this bacterium (Smith and Iglewski, 2003; Dietrich et al., 2006). The autoregulatory systems of pseudomonads also use factors d_1 , i.e., alkylhydroxybenzenes (AHBs) (Osipov et al., 1985; Nowak- Thompson et al., 2003). Their extracellular level increases in developing bacterial cultures, and their involvement in the transition to the state of dormancy

Fig. 5. Electron micrographs of the sections of *P. aeruginosa* PAO1 cells of the type 1 persister fractions 14 days (a, b) and 1 month (c–e) after adding CF. CLC of different types are shown (1–3). Designations: LP, loop-shaped protrusions: P, the cell pole with an enlarged periplasmic space containing an electron-dense substance; NDA, nucleus disintegration areas; the other designations are the same as in Fig. 4. Bar, $0.5 \mu m$.

was established (El'-Registan et al., 2006; Mulyukin et al., 2008).

With regard to an additional survival strategy used by antibiotic-treated *P. aeruginosa*, we should empha size the validity of the conclusion that existence of the cells in a state of proliferative dormancy in planktonic (Mulyukin et al., 2008, 2014) and biofilm (Drenkard and Ausubel, 2002; Kirisits et al., 2005) cultures is cor related with an increased emergence of anitibiotic resistant variants. This applies to the Sm type that grows on the solid medium with $CF(1 \mu g/mL)$ and is similar, in terms of colony morphology, to the kana mycin-resistant *P. aeruginosa* variant described earlier (Drenkard and Ausubel, 2002). This correlation is to a greater extent characteristic of strain 393 than of strain PAO1 (Tables 1 and 2). In addition, it was established in this work that, regardless of a culture's age and the

well as the P2 and P1 subpopulations, contains a frac tion of CF-tolerant cells. Its cell number is relatively constant $(10^2-10^3 \text{ cells/mL})$, and it develops after plating on an antibiotic-containing medium in the form of microcolonies ($d \le 0.5$ mm) (Tables 1–3). The presence of a cell subpopulation with an anti-

biotic-insensitive phenotype and its ability to revert to the conventional dominant type can cause serious problems in terms of medical practice.

trophic conditions of its development, the culture, as

In general, the results of this work demonstrate the multilevel heterogeneity of the type 1 and 2 persister subpopulations and of the dormant cells derived from them; this does not contradict the Yin-Yang model that takes into account the diversity of the forms and mechanisms of antibiotic tolerance (Zhang, 2014). The dormant forms of *P. aeruginosa* PAO1 revealed by

MICROBIOLOGY Vol. 84 No. 6 2015

Fig. 6. Electron micrographs of the sections of *P. aeruginosa* PAO1 cells of the type 2 persister fractions 22 h (a–c) and 1 month (d, e) after adding CF. A cell fragment with loop-shaped outer membrane protrusions is shown in micrograph (c). Designations: LP, loop-shaped protrusions; OM, outer membrane; PS, periplasmic space; L, L form. Enlarged cell envelope fragments are shown in cell micrographs (e, f). Bar, $0.5 \mu m$.

us in the control cultures and in the fractions capable of long-term survival after an antibiotic attack are can didates for the persisters that exist in bacteria-carrying individuals and during latent infections. Along with antibiotic-resistant cells, they hold much value as test system components to be used for assessing the effi ciency of drug candidates against antibiotic-resistant infections.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This work was supported by the Russian Founda tion for Basic Research (project no. 13-00-40229-k).

REFERENCES

Balaban, N.Q., Merrin, J., Chait, R., Kowalik, L., and Leibler, S.. Bacterial persistence as a phenotypic switch, *Science*, 2004, vol. 305, pp. 1622–1625.

Bédard, E., Charron, D., Lalancette, C., Déziel, E., and Prévost, M., Recovery of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* cultura bility following copper- and chlorine-induced stress, *FEMS Microbiol. Lett.*, 2014, vol. 356, no. 2, pp. 226–234.

Bigger, J.W., Treatment of staphylococcal infections with penicillin by intermittent sterilisation, *Lancet*, 1944, pp. 497–500.

Costerton, J.W., Camper, A.K., Stewart, P.S., Zelver, N., and Dirckx, M.E., The problem: not just bacteria–bacterial biofilms, *The Analyst*, 1999, vol. 6, no. 3, pp. 18–25.

Dietrich, L.E., Price-Whelan, A., Petersen, A., Whiteley, M., and Newman, D.K., The phenazine pyocya nin is a terminal signaling factor in the quorum sensing net work of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*, *Mol. Microbiol.,* 2006, vol. 61, pp. 1308–1321.

Drenkard, E. and Ausubel, F.M., Pseudomonas biofilm for mation and antibiotic resistance are linked to phenotypic variation, *Nature*, 2002, vol. 416, pp. 740–743.

Dwidjosiswojo, Z., Richard, J., Moritz, M.M., Dopp, E., Flemming, H.-C., and Wingender, J., Influence of copper ions on the viability and cytotoxicity of *Pseudomonas aerug inosa* under conditions relevant to drinking water environ ments, *Int. J. Hyg. Environ. Health*, 2011, vol. 214, pp. 485– 492.

El-Registan, G.I., Mulyukin, A.L., Nikolaev, Yu.A., Suz ina, N.E., Galchenko, V.F., and Duda, V.I., Adaptogenic functions of extracellular autoregulators of microorgan isms, *Microbiology* (Moscow), 2006, vol. 75, no. 4, pp. 380– 389.

Fick, R.B., *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*: the microbial hyena and its role in disease: an introduction, in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa, the Opportunist: Pathogenesis and Disease*, Fick, R.B., Ed., Boca Raton: CRC, 1993, pp. 1–5.

Gefen, O. and Balaban, N.Q., The importance of being persistent: heterogeneity of bacterial populations under antibiotic stress, *FEMS Microbiol. Rev.*, 2009, vol. 33, pp. 707–717.

Grant, S.S. and Hung, D.T., Persistent bacterial infections, antibiotic tolerance, and the oxidative stress response, *Vir ulence*, 2013, vol. 4, no. 4, pp. 273–283.

Keren, I., Shah, D., Spoering, A., Kaldalu, N., and Lewis, K., Specialized persister cells and the mechanism of multidrug tolerance in *Escherichia coli, J. Bacteriol.,* 2004a, vol. 186, pp. 8172–8180.

Keren, I., Kaldalu, N., Spoering, A., Wang, Y., and Lewis, K., Persister cells and tolerance to antimicrobials, *FEMS Microbiol. Lett.*, 2004b, vol. 230, pp. 13–18.

Kim, J., Hahn, J.-S., Franklin, M.J., Stewart, P.S., and Yoon, J., Tolerance of dormant and active cells in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* PAO1 biofilm to antimicrobial agents, *J. Antimicrob. Chemother.*, 2009, vol. 63, pp. 129– 135.

Kirisits, M.J., Pros, L., Starkey, M., and Parsek, M.R., Characterization of colony morphology variants isolated from *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* biofilms, *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.*, 2005, vol. 71, pp. 4809–4821.

Kwan, B.W., Valenta, J.A., Benedik, M.J., and Wood, T.K., Arrested protein synthesis increases persister-like cell for mation, *Antimicrob. Agents Chemother.,* 2013, vol. 57, pp. 1468–1473.

Leung, K., Cassidy, M.B., Holmes, S.B., Lee, H., and Trevors, J.T., Survival of κ-carrageenan-encapsulated and unencapsulated *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* UG2Lr cells in forest soil monitored by polymerase chain reaction and spread plating, *FEMS Microbiol. Ecol.*, 1995. vol. 16, pp. 71–82.

Lewis, K., Persister cells, dormancy and infectious disease, *Nat. Rev. Microbiol.*, 2007, vol. 5, pp. 48–56.

Li, L., Mendis, N., Trigui, H., Oliver, J.D., and Faucher, S.P., The importance of the viable but non-cultur able state in human bacterial pathogens, *Front. Microbiol.*, 2014, vol. 5, p. 258.

Millar, M., Constraining the use of antibiotics: applying Scanlon's contractualism, *J. Med. Ethics.*, 2012, vol. 38, no. 8, pp. 465–469.

Möker, N., Dean, C.R., and Tao, J., *Pseudomonas aerugi nosa* increases formation of multidrug-tolerant persister cells in response to quorum-sensing signaling molecules, *J. Bacteriol.*, 2010, vol. 192, no. 7, pp. 1946–1955.

Mulyukin, A.L., Suzina, N.E., Duda, V.I., and El- Registan, G.I., Structural and physiological diversity among cyst-like resting cells of bacteria of the genus *Pseudomonas, Microbiology* (Moscow), 2008, vol. 77, no. 4, pp. 455–465.

Mulyukin, A.L., Kudykina, Yu.K., Shleeva, M.O., Anuchin, A.M., Suzina, N.E., Danilevich, V.N., Duda, V.I., Kaprelyants, A.S., and El-Registan, G.I., Intraspecies diversity of dormant forms of *Mycobacterium smegmatis, Microbiology* (Moscow), 2010, vol. 79, no. 4, pp. 461–471.

Mulyukin, A.L., Suzina, N.E., Melnikov, V.G., Galchenko, V.F., and El-Registan, G.I., Dormant state and phenotypic variability of *Staphylococcus aureus* and *Coryne bacterium pseudodiphtheriticum, Microbiology* (Moscow), 2014, vol. 83, nos. 1–2, pp. 149–159.

Nguyen, D., Joshi-Datar, A., Lepine, F., Bauerle, E., Ola kanmi, O., Beer, K., McKay, G., Siehnel, R., Schafhauser, J., Wang, Y., Britigan, B.E., and Singh, P.K., Active starvation responses mediate antibiotic tolerance in biofilms and nutrient-limited bacteria, *Science*, 2011, vol. 334, no. 6058, pp. 982–986.

Nowak-Thompson, B., Hammer, P.E., Hill, D.S., Stafford, J., Torkewitz, N., Gaffney, T.D., Lam, S.T., Mol nar, I., and Ligon, J.M., 2,5-Dialkylresorcinol biosynthesis in *Pseudomonas aurantiaca*: novel head-to-head condensa tion of two fatty acid-derived precursors, *J. Bacteriol.*, 2003, vol. 185, pp. 860–869.

Osipov, G.A., El-Registan, G.I., Svetlichnyi, V.A., Kozlova, A.N., Duda, V.I., Kaprel'yants, A.S., and Poma zanov, V.V., The chemical nature of the autoregulatory factor d1 in *Pseudomonas carboxydoflava, Microbiology*, 1985, vol. 54, no. 1, pp. 142–145.

Roszak, D.B. and Colwell, R.R., Metabolic activity of bac terial cells enumerated by direct viable count, *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.*, 1987, vol. 53, pp. 2889–2893.

Shah, D., Zhang, Z., Khodursky, A.B., Kaldalu, N., Kurg, K., and Lewis, K., Persisters: a distinct physiological state of *E. coli, BMC Microbiol.*, 2006, vol. 6, p. 53.

Smith, R.S. and Iglewski, B.H., *P. aeruginosa* quorum sensing systems and virulence, *Curr. Opin. Microbiol.*, 2003, vol. 6, pp. 56–60.

Wood, T.K., Knabel, S.J., and Kwan, B.W., Bacterial persis ter cell formation and dormancy, *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.*, 2013, vol. 79, no. 23, pp. 7116–7121.

Xu, K.D., Stewart, P.S., Xia, F., Huang, C.-T., and McFeters, G.A., Spatial physiological heterogeneity in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* biofilm is determined by oxygen availability, *Appl. Env. Microbiol.*, 1998, vol. 64, pp. 4035– 4039.

Zhang, Y., Persisters, persistent infections and the Yin– Yang model, *Emerg. Microb. Infect.,* 2014. 3. e3.

Translated by A. Oleskin

MICROBIOLOGY Vol. 84 No. 6 2015